

PART III

DEVELOPMENT OF THE BANTU AREAS

CHAPTER 25

DETERMINATION OF POLICY

I. INTRODUCTION.

1. The Commission has deemed it necessary to place a wide interpretation upon its terms of reference, and the scope of its task. At an early stage, it became convinced of the very close relationship between the existence and future rôle of the Bantu Areas and the so-called Native problem in general, especially in view of the fact that a piecemeal approach to this problem is most undesirable. It is thus obvious why the Commission deemed it necessary to give consideration to the question of general policy. Its deliberations in this respect, are fully set out in Chapter 25 of the Report.

2. After careful study, the Commission has come to the definite conclusion that the so-called Native question is, undoubtedly, the most formidable and urgent of South Africa's problems. A realisation of this fact, and of the gravity and urgency of the situation must be brought home to every thinking person in our country. More intensive study of the problem should be undertaken and its supreme importance recognised by making it the deciding factor, both in private life and thought, and in the formation of state policy and action. The Commission has been impressed by the large measure of anxiety and concern that exists in responsible circles—both European and Bantu—as to what the future holds in this sphere; but it has also noted the ignorance, the absence of any sincere appreciation of the importance and complexity of the problem, the lack of interest and the prejudiced approach evinced in some quarters.

3. The Commission wishes to emphasise that a clear and purposeful policy, as well as the logical application and co-ordination of the principles laid down, is absolutely essential if an ultimate condition of affairs, unsatisfactory in the highest degree to all sections of the population, is to be avoided.

4. The most important facts and features of the present situation in regard to the place the Bantu occupy in South Africa and the part they play, have already been dealt with in previous chapters. At this point, therefore, only a brief reference will be made to some of the more important aspects. Territorial segregation has been the accepted policy of South Africa

since earliest times and, after 1910, was confirmed by the legislation of 1913 and 1936, by means of which some 19½ million morgen of land will eventually be set aside as Bantu territory. The purpose behind these measures was, undoubtedly, to create a national home for the Bantu, while at the same time limiting their rights in the non-Bantu areas. A necessary corollary to this legislation was the political adjustment introduced by Act No. 12 of 1936, by which the exercise of political power by the Bantu outside their own areas, was restricted, while opportunities for self-expression were to be created or provided on a fairly extensive scale within the Bantu Areas (see Chapter 17). Act No. 46 of 1937, was a further complementary measure by means of which drastic limitations were placed on the acquisition by Bantu of land in the urban areas.

II. LEGISLATION.

5. Our legislative policy, therefore, attempts to bring about territorial separation—or a large measure of it—and thus also (territorial) separateness as regards political and social development. This policy has, however, not been fully implemented or followed to its logical conclusion. Bantu are leaving the Reserves in ever greater numbers to settle permanently in the non-Bantu areas. The following factors are responsible for this situation:—

- (i) the undeveloped and backward state of the Bantu Areas;
- (ii) the slow rate of progress in the purchase of land under the 1936 Act;
- (iii) the process of economic integration that has taken place on such a large scale during the past decade, as a result of a large number of factors; and
- (iv) the slow and half-hearted manner in which administrative powers were conferred on the Bantu in the Bantu Areas.

6. Seen from the point of view of geographical distribution of population, the policy has, however, shown positive results in the sense that the Bantu Areas are today the domicile of slightly more than half of the Union-born Bantu.

III. URBANISATION OF THE BANTU.

7. The integration and utilisation of the Bantu as labourers, and their consequent urbanisation in non-Bantu areas, have given rise to numerous problems, as e.g.—

- (i) the social problems in urban areas;
- (ii) the housing shortage in urban areas;
- (iii) the westernisation of the Bantu; and
- (iv) the dependence upon Bantu labour.

8. It has become customary to describe the migration of the Bantu to the towns as a natural economic phenomenon, comparable with the process of urbanisation in other countries, and with the flow of Europeans to the towns in our own country during the 1930's. In certain respects, the townward movement of the Bantu can well be regarded as a normal feature, in as much as the urban areas exercise an attraction (on account of employment opportunities available and the demand for labour), and because the Bantu Areas do not offer sufficient means of subsistence to their inhabitants.

9. There are, however, certain basic differences between the Bantu immigration to the towns, and the ordinary process of urbanisation. For the Bantu, urbanisation has the following implications:—

- (i) that a relatively primitive population group is transferred to what, to them, is a highly developed environment with a completely strange social, economic, political and linguistic milieu;
- (ii) that, owing to the racial differences, the Bantu entering the towns are adopted into the existing Bantu community only (and are not integrated into the European community, as occurred in the case of the poor whites), with the result that the uncertain and unstable character of the urban Bantu community is thereby intensified; and
- (iii) that problems of much wider scope are created than are usually connected with the process of urbanisation. As a result of these and other considerations, urbanisation of the Bantu cannot be regarded in the same indifferent light as was, for example, the case with the poor whites. The position would, of course, have been quite different had the urbanisation occurred within the Bantu Areas.

10. The integration of the Bantu in the national economy of the non-Bantu areas has not led to a relaxation of the over-all pattern of segregation; in fact, the segregation principle has been strengthened and extended to cover the new contingencies arising out of the process of economic integration and urbanisation.

11. Before endeavouring to analyse the present situation and to recommend a course for the future, mention must be made of the confusion of ideas often met with in regard to this subject—for instance in regard to such concepts as assimilation, equality, equal treatment, integration, segregation, apartheid, guardianship, etc.

IV. CHARACTERISTICS OF THE PRESENT SITUATION.

12. The existing condition of and trend towards integration, are characterised by the following:—

- (i) economic activity in the non-Bantu areas, is largely dependent upon cheap, unskilled Bantu labour, and an interweaving of interests and activities is taking place;
- (ii) this process of integration results in the acquisition of domicile in the non-Bantu areas, by large numbers of Bantu and their descendants; and
- (iii) the process leads to the detribalisation, urbanisation and westernisation of the Bantu.

V. CONSEQUENCES OF INTEGRATION.

13. The two population groups in South Africa are thus becoming more and more interwoven, especially in the cultural, political and economic spheres. Historical data tend to show that, in a society where development takes place in an evolutionary way, i.e. where social, economic and other factors have free play, the following consequences may be expected from such intermingling of interests:—

- (i) cultural assimilation as the result of contact, i.e. the gradual diminution of differences in culture and level of civilisation, until these differences eventually disappear for the great majority of each of the respective population groups;
- (ii) the removal or disappearance of all economic measures differentiating between the two groups. This leads to the development of a socio-economic stratification based not on colour, but on purely social-economic considerations;
- (iii) cultural and economic equality leading to political equality, and the creation of a common society in the political sphere;
- (iv) these conditions give rise to increased social contact and association, with the consequent disappearances of any stigma attached to such contact and association. Personal relationships come to be based upon socio-economic preferences or prejudices; and
- (v) the ultimate result—though it may take a long time to materialise—is complete racial assimilation, leading to the creation, out of the two original communities, of a new biological entity.

14. Against the background of integration set out above, the developments and the consequences briefly discussed here, may be expected when one community comes into contact with another, and a process of intermixing and assimilation is begun without conscious efforts to stop it or to guide or force the process into a definite or contrary direction. Applying these principles to the situation in South Africa, the following questions naturally arise:—

- (i) Can it be assumed that this process (of ultimate complete assimilation) could develop unhindered, i.e. in a purely evolutionary way in South Africa?

- (ii) If so, what would be the ultimate result?
- (iii) If such evolution were not to take place, why not, and what would then be the possible or probable course of events in South Africa?

VI. EVOLUTIONARY DEVELOPMENT TOWARDS A COMMON SOCIETY.

15. There is a body of opinion which contends that a common or unified society could develop in South Africa in an evolutionary manner (i.e. in the course of time and without undue friction), because there is a large number of factors present which tends to bring about a change in the characteristic attitude and views of the European population. Among these factors are the following:—

- (i) the fact of economic integration and the consequent realisation of mutual economic dependence: As the contribution of each of the two groups towards their joint existence is realised and appreciated, and as the Bantu are employed on an ever-increasing scale in semi-skilled and skilled capacities, a realisation of the essential unity of the two groups will inevitably come about;
- (ii) the urbanisation of the Bantu, and the consequent disappearance of the old established personal relations;
- (iii) the Christianisation, development and westernisation of the Bantu, which will lead to the disappearance of the differences in civilisation, culture and religion, and thus of the concepts and attitudes based on these differences;
- (iv) the fact that South Africa is the common mother-country of the two groups;
- (v) the need to establish friendly relations with the indigenous peoples of Africa, in view of their numerical preponderance and the insecure position of the European population in Africa, should these peoples become their sworn enemies;
- (vi) the psychological pressure exerted by international opinion on South Africa;
- (vii) the necessity to guard against the largely illiterate indigenous populations of Africa falling a prey to communism;
- (viii) the necessity to retain Africa for the Western world and Western civilisation in the struggle between East and West;
- (ix) the dictates of the European conscience and religion;
- (x) the increasing number of individual Europeans who are not prepared to acquiesce in the traditional pattern of race relations; and finally
- (xi) the consideration that there is no alternative policy which could be followed.

16. On the grounds of these (and other) considerations, the conviction is expressed that a change of attitude amongst the European group will come about, and that this will lead to the granting to the Bantu, in an integrated political structure, of equal rights and privileges in the economic, political and social fields. In this way then, the ultimate goal of a completely interwoven society with equal rights in every respect, will be peacefully attained.

17. At whatever speed, and in whatever manner the evolutionary process of integration and equalisation between European and Bantu might take place, there can be no doubt as to the ultimate outcome in the political sphere, namely that the control of political power will pass into the hands of the Bantu.

It is possible that European paramountcy might be maintained for some time, by manipulation of the franchise qualifications; but without a doubt the government of the country will eventually be exercised by those elected by the majority of voters. Theoretically, it is possible that the non-Europeans who would then constitute the majority of voters, might prefer to have the country ruled by Europeans. Such a supposition appears highly doubtful, and certainly improbable. But, even if such were to be the case, the rulers of a democratic country would have to carry out the will of the majority of the people, which means to say, that the European orientation of our legislation and government will inevitably disappear.

18. The witnesses who appeared before the Commission, disagreed as to the eventual extent of miscegenation that may occur. The Commission has come to the conclusion that such miscegenation will certainly come about in the circumstances mentioned above.

19. As regards the possibility of an evolutionary development in the direction indicated, it is of course true that people's ideas and convictions are not static, and that many factors may contribute to produce a change. The influence of the several economic and psychological factors mentioned above cannot, therefore, be totally disregarded. The fundamental question is, however, whether there is ground for believing that the development sketched above, will take place in an evolutionary and peaceful way.

VII. LITTLE HOPE OF ATTAINING A UNIFIED SOCIETY THROUGH EVOLUTIONARY DEVELOPMENT.

20. The Commission is convinced that there is little hope of evolutionary development occurring in South Africa along the lines indicated. The responsibility and task laid upon the European to Christianise and civilise the indigenous peoples, demand that the former should retain the direction of affairs in the foreseeable future. Even more important is the consideration that over the past 300 years, the European population of the Union has developed into an autonomous and complete national organism, and has furthermore preserved its character as a biological (racial) entity. There are not the slightest grounds for believing that the European population, either now or in the future, would be willing to sacrifice its character as a national entity and as a European racial group. The combination of these two factors makes the position and struggle of the European people in South Africa, unique in the world.

That the European people will not be prepared willingly to sacrifice their right of existence as a separate national and racial entity, must be accepted as the dominant fact in the South African situation.

21. The various factors mentioned in paragraph 15, have to be judged in the light of this consideration. In this connection, it should be pointed out that—

- (i) where the continued existence of a people is at stake, purely rational considerations play a relatively unimportant rôle;
- (ii) unsympathetic international opinion, and internal efforts directed against the national and racial survival of the Europeans, will probably lead to reaction, and have the effect of strengthening their determination to retain their right of self-preservation;
- (iii) it is quite possible that the opinions of the European population may undergo change, but as soon as it becomes manifestly clear that a particular action or development directly or indirectly threatens its existence, it will, as a community, strongly oppose such action or development; and
- (iv) some witnesses expressed the conviction that the European population feels so strongly over this matter that, if given the choice, it would be willing to subordinate economic considerations and advantages to this aim.

22. If development towards a single society is to proceed peacefully along evolutionary lines, the Europeans will at some stage or other have to make a right-about turn, at least in regard to certain aspects of race relations, since there can be no purpose in continuing to believe that the two groups can possibly develop towards unity if, in practice, differentiating and discriminatory measures are taken in an ever-increasing degree.

If there is any hope of the two groups developing into a common society politically, the European parliament would have to take steps at some time or another, to make political equality possible. It has to be borne in mind that a solution of this problem will only then have been achieved, when a satisfactory arrangement in regard to the political aspect, is arrived at.

23. If ultimate political equality and unity is to be the goal, it might be brought about by one of the following methods:—

- (i) the immediate granting of political rights to all Bantu over 21 years of age—as in the case of Europeans;
- (ii) the granting of group representation to the Bantu population, on such a basis that their representation in Parliament would eventually be equal to, or even greater than, that of the European population; and
- (iii) the granting of the franchise, on a common roll, to everyone, of whatever racial group, who possesses the required qualifications.

24. After analysing these three possibilities (in paragraphs 47-51 of Chapter 25 of the Report), the Commission concludes that, during the following few decades, there can be little chance of spontaneous evolutionary development into a single community in South Africa. It is possible that such development may take place here in the course of many generations, but the pace at which such a change might come about

would be so gradual that it would offer little hope of a solution, by assimilation, of our present problems or those of the near future. In any case, it cannot be stated with any certainty that the European population would ever voluntarily agree to the creation of a single political community such as that envisaged. It might happen, for instance, that in the distant future the French nation might be willing to fuse completely with the German people; it would be foolish, however, to regard such a possibility as a certainty. The development which took place in former British India, is somewhat analogous to our own situation. Mainly on account of religious considerations, British India was divided into Pakistan and India. In South Africa, the differences between the two groups are much more fundamental than those between the two groups in India.

25. It is, therefore, clear that if the integration of the two population groups proceed in an increasing measure, the desired peaceful relationships will only be reached or maintained—

- (i) provided the European population is prepared to change its ideas and convictions so rapidly that full satisfaction can be given to the increasing and already active political needs and aspirations of the Bantu population; or
- (ii) provided the Bantu population is willing to accept a continuation of the existing position, for an indefinite length of time.

26. The first possibility need not be considered, seeing that the European population's determination to keep its political destiny in its own hands, can be accepted as an obvious fact. If, on the other hand, the assumption is correct that the Bantu population is becoming more and more politically conscious, the idea that they will be content to acquiesce in the present situation, is equally untenable. The Commission was given ample evidence of the existence of an active desire among the Bantu for participation in the government of the country. What the extent of this desire is, is difficult to determine, because it is not always clear whether the great majority of the Bantu give much thought to the matter; neither is it clear in what degree recent activities of this nature should be ascribed to the support given by the dissatisfied Indian community in South Africa, by communists and others of leftist leanings, by other organisations within and outside the Union, by UNO, etc.

27. At the moment, the number of Bantu who actively advocate equality, forms a small minority, but their numbers and the scope and intensity of their endeavours are on the increase. It would be unwise to disregard this development. The plain fact is that the European population will have to face up to the effects of the developments of the past fifty years, the detribalisation of the Bantu, and the breaking up of their organic tribal units, their urbanisation, their contact with Western culture and ways of life, and the integration of a large portion of the Bantu in the economic and thus also the political and social life of the European.

28. The first dilemma with which this policy of integration confronts the South African people, is self-evident and may be described in the following terms:—

On the part of the European population, there is an unshakeable resolve to maintain their right of self-determination as a national and racial entity; while on the part of the Bantu, there is a growing conviction that they are entitled to, and there is an increasing demand for, the fruits of integration, including an ever-greater share in the control of the country.

VIII. INTEGRATION LEADS TO RACIAL FRICTION.

29. Seeing that a peaceful evolutionary development towards a common society is out of the question, the policy of integration could only lead to problems and dangers of the gravest intensity.

30. It is clear that a continuation of the policy of integration would intensify racial friction and animosity, and that the only alternative is to promote the establishment of separate communities in their own, separate territories where each will have the fullest opportunity for self-expression and development.

IX. OBJECTIONS TO THE POLICY OF SEPARATE DEVELOPMENT.

31. There are, no doubt, some who question the advisability or practicability of such a policy; these fall into the following four categories:—

- (i) those who believe in the possibility of a "middle course";
- (ii) those who think it wrong to adopt a fixed course of action or policy in such matters, believing that a policy of *laissez-faire* should be followed, and that problems should be dealt with as they arise;
- (iii) those who consider the conclusion arrived at by the Commission, to be out of step with present economic conditions and trends, holding that the existence and acceptance of integration are unavoidable, and that any other policy, favouring the creation of separate communities, is unpractical and impracticable; and
- (iv) those who hold that the ultimate results of a policy based on the separate development of the two groups, would in some respects be more dangerous to the European population, than one based on integration.

32. Closer examination of the possibilities of a "middle-of-the-road" policy, and of a *laissez-faire* policy, leads to the conclusion that both of these alternatives can be discarded as offering no hope of a solution of the problem.

33. The importance of economic considerations on which the criticism referred to in (iii) above is based, cannot be underrated; however, the economic aspect is only one facet of the problem, and the decision rests with the people themselves, as to which factor or group of factors is to be regarded as paramount. If the European population decides, for economic reasons, to continue the process of integration, it will have to accept the political and social consequences of such

action; if, on the other hand, it considers that political and social considerations are of primary importance, it must be prepared to restrict and replace the process of integration. For the Bantu population, the choice is no less momentous; it has to decide whether it wishes to form part of a community in which it will, for obvious reasons, be under constant restraint or, whether it desires to adopt a fuller life as a separate national entity in its own territory.

34. The second dilemma in which South Africa finds itself, becomes apparent from the above discussion. The process of integration obviously creates large social and political problems; if, however, the process is to be reversed, a reorientation of the economic structure of the country, on a more or less comprehensive scale, will become inevitable.

35. The argument is sometimes used that the Bantu Areas are not large enough, or do not possess the required potential for development, to make a policy of separate development a practical proposition. From Chapter 45 of the Report it appears, in the light of the knowledge we now possess, that the Bantu Areas, properly developed, would be capable of carrying a population equal to that of the present Bantu population of the Union, and of providing them with a reasonable standard of living. The development of industries in the so-called border areas, would help to accommodate an even larger Bantu population in the Bantu Areas.

It is, however, essential that attention be given as early as possible to the formation of policy to deal with the future increase of population.

The Commission is of the opinion that the High Commission Territories should be incorporated in the Union as soon as possible. The implementation of the policy of separate development as set out in this chapter, would have to be effected, as far as the foreseeable future is concerned, within the framework of the consolidated Bantu Areas of the Union, those of South West Africa and the High Commission Territories.

36. Circumstances necessitate that a clear and unequivocal choice be made, and the obvious way out of the dilemma is to proceed with the large-scale, sustained development of the Bantu Areas.

Whatever the decision may be, it is clear that there can be no rapid change in the *de facto* position.

It can be argued against the finding of the Commission, that the ultimate results of a policy aimed at separate development of the two groups would, in some respects, be more dangerous to the European population than integration. No one is, of course, able to foretell just how the relations will develop in future, but it is possible that, under the conditions envisaged by the Commission, the underlying tension and fear felt by both groups, would disappear; that the Europeans' guidance and efforts in the development of the Bantu Areas would not be without effect; and, furthermore, that it has to be accepted that political development will in any case take place in the areas north of the Union.

X. SEPARATE DEVELOPMENT AND THE BANTU.

38. The policy of separate development is a prerequisite for the sound national development of the Bantu communities, and in particular, will bring them—

- (i) their own, unalienable territory;
- (ii) the creation of opportunities for individual and communal development;
- (iii) the opportunity to take charge of their own affairs; and
- (iv) full opportunity for economic development, *inter alia* in the direction of—
 - (a) greater economic diversification,
 - (b) creation of an entrepreneurial class,
 - (c) opportunities for entering the professions and semi-skilled and skilled employment,
 - (d) the provision of extensive social services and security, and
 - (e) the building up of a sound social order.

39. There may be members of the Bantu community who will be sceptical about these prospects being fulfilled, but the Commission is of opinion that such misgivings about the good faith of the Europeans, are not justified.

XI. ADVANTAGES TO THE EUROPEANS.

40. The policy of separate development is the only means by which the Europeans can ensure their future unfettered existence, by which increasing race tensions and clashes can be avoided, and by means of which the Europeans will be able fully to meet their responsibilities as guardians of the Bantu population. The European population should, therefore, be willing to take the necessary action and to make the sacrifices required to put this policy into effect.

XII. JUSTIFICATION FOR THE COMMISSION'S COMMENTS.

41. The Commission feels that it is justified in commenting on this question of general policy because—

- (i) the problem is not one that can be dealt with piecemeal;
- (ii) its conclusions provide the most urgent reason why the European population should be willing to grant the extensive financial, technical and other assistance required for the proper development of the Bantu Areas, and why the co-operation of the Bantu people could be expected in this development; and
- (iii) the preservation and continuation of the reserves as Bantu Areas can only be entertained and justified on the grounds of these considerations of principle.

XIII. THE CHOICE.

42. The Commission believes that it is possible so to regulate our race relations in this country, as to ensure to both groups a maximum degree of satisfaction. It is evident that one group should not seek to further its interests and future position at the cost of the other.

Satisfaction can only be obtained on the basis of an ethical formula, which meets all the requirements of justice and equity. This can be stated as follows:—

That, as the Bantu come to share our Christian principles and our civilisation, and their sense of duty and of responsibility develops, all rights and privileges, as well as duties and responsibilities will have to be accorded them either (a) together with the Europeans (i.e. as part and parcel of the European community); or (b) together as Bantu (i.e. in their own communities). There can be no middle course in the future. Indeed, the present so-called middle way leads, as already pointed out, inescapably towards integration. The only alternatives available are, therefore, either the path of ultimate complete integration (i.e. of fusion with the Europeans), or that of ultimate complete separation between Europeans and Bantu.

This statement is not intended to imply the creation of a single large Bantustan, but rather the development of a national home for at least each of the bigger ethnic groups as set out in Chapter 46.

Either of the two policies demands a sacrifice—that of integration, the ultimate liquidation of the Europeans' right of self-determination, their identity and their survival as a separate national entity; that of separate development, altruism and self-sacrifice on the part of the Europeans in order to make such development possible. The financial implications of such sacrifice are indicated in Chapter 49.

This, indeed, is the crossroads at which the people of South Africa have come; a clear-cut and definite choice is inevitable. The Commission is convinced that the only solution is the separate development of European and Bantu.

XIV. MINORITY POINT OF VIEW OF COMMISSION MEMBER BISSCHOP.

43. Commission member Bisschop does not agree with Chapter 25, and submits in its place, the following minority point of view.

1. The first Dutch settlers in this country were willing to—and at first did—treat the aborigines they encountered, as their equals. Soon, however, they found this to be unpractical because of the differences in civilisation and cultural development.

2. Due mainly to these differences, the history of race-relations in South Africa, has been one of discrimination.

3. This discrimination, however, did not prevent the progressive integration of the Bantu into the economic development of the country, by the Europeans.

4. Such integration cannot continue on the basis of discrimination; a solution to this problem must be found.

5. There exist, among the Europeans in this country, three schools of thought about how to get out of this impasse in which the country finds itself.

6. (A) The "integration" school, the supporters of which postulate that rights and privileges imply responsibilities, and that such rights and privileges may be granted only to those who are able to carry the associated responsibilities.

7. In order to decide who (Europeans as well as non-Europeans) shall enjoy full citizen rights, criteria of civilisation and cultural development must be formulated and applied.

8. On this basis, it will be possible to maintain the present level of Western civilisation in this country, and to ensure its further evolutionary development.

9. Such a system will allow the granting of equal economic and political rights to non-Europeans, without necessarily leading to social and biological integration.

10. The school holds that both Europeans and Bantu wish, and are determined, to retain their racial and biological identities, and is convinced that as long as this wish and determination persist, the separate identities can and will be maintained.

11. Finally, those who subscribe to the principle of integration, hold that, because of the low general level of Western civilisation and culture, so far attained by the Bantu in this country, and the further metamorphosis through which they will have to pass before they will be able to carry the responsibilities which go with full economic and political rights, the Europeans will have to retain their present position as leaders and trustees, for a long time to come.

12. (B) The "halfway" or "middle-of-the-road" school, regards economic integration as essential and unavoidable for the present and future welfare of both Europeans and non-Europeans, but advocates segregation in all other spheres of community and family life.

13. In industries, members of the separate racial groups will work together on terms of equality wherever necessary, but the racial groups must have separate residential areas, public services, local authorities, and higher legislative bodies such as parliaments and senates.

14. A supreme body, representative of the racial groups concerned, will co-ordinate and control the work of the separate legislative bodies.

15. It is held that such a system of partial integration will satisfy the racial groups concerned, and will ensure not only their economic futures, but also their respective racial and biological identities.

16. (C) The "segregation" school, postulates, as do the other two schools, that the Bantu have the same right as the Europeans, to develop themselves fully in all spheres of life.

17. If, however, the Bantu are so to develop themselves within the European areas of this country, such development must inevitably lead to—

- (a) equal economic rights,
- (b) equal political rights,
- (c) social equality,
- (d) biological equality and admixture,
- (e) the disappearance of the Europeans as a separate racial entity, and

(f) the disappearance, to a large extent, of the civilisation and culture which the Europeans brought with them to—and developed in—this country.

18. The only way to prevent this from happening, is to help the Bantu to develop fully, in their own Areas.

19. The school is convinced, that when the Europeans realise fully the implications of the present impasse, they will be willing to make whatever sacrifices are necessary to help the Bantu to develop fully in their own, the Bantu Areas.

20. All three schools of thought stress the determination of the Europeans in this country, to maintain their biological and racial identity and the attained standard of Western civilisation.

21. The obvious weakness in the formula of the "integration" school is, that it does not appear humanly possible to devise measurable criteria of civilisation and cultural development, with which to select those (European as well as non-European) who claim economic and political rights. Without such measurable criteria the "integration" school's formula cannot be applied. Without a sufficiently high and clearly defined barrier which all who claim full citizen rights must negotiate, it will not be possible to maintain our standard of Western civilisation, or the separate identity of the Europeans.

22. In the formula of the "halfway" school, the main obvious weakness is the impossibility of setting up a body which will be able to co-ordinate the activities of the separate racial groups, and exercise an overall authority, to the satisfaction of each group.

23. The practicability of the "segregation" school's formula is also open to grave doubts. Is the present trend of Bantu economic integration reversible and, if it is, for how long will it remain so, taking into account its ever-increasing tempo? Is it possible to make the Europeans sufficiently conscious of the full implications of the existing impasse, and to make them willing to provide whatever is required to bring about such a revival in the present trend, while it is still possible to do so? Is it possible to develop the Bantu Areas at a rate which will allow not only for the permanent accommodation of the Union's present Bantu population during the foreseeable future, but also for its formidable natural increase? And, will it, indeed, be possible to make conditions in the Bantu Areas sufficiently attractive, to draw the Bantu away from the European areas, voluntarily? These are but a few of the many imponderabilia about the feasibility of the policy advocated by the "segregation" school.

24. Although none of the policies discussed, appears to offer a practical way out of the existing dilemma, there is this important difference between them, namely, that the formulae of the "integration" and "halfway" schools of thought cannot be tested out in practice. In order to do so, it would be necessary to remove the existing discriminatory regulations and usages, and once these have been removed, it will not be possible to re-introduce them.

25. The "segregation" formula, however, can be tested out in practice without necessarily affecting the Europeans or Bantu adversely. It is, therefore, the duty of the Europeans towards themselves, the Bantu and to posterity, to investigate fully the potentialities

of the Bantu Areas, to determine the number of Bantu that can be accommodated permanently in the Bantu Areas under conditions which will allow of the attainment of their legitimate aspirations, and to draw up plans for the efficient exploitation of the potentialities of the Bantu Areas, for—and as far as possible by—the Bantu themselves.

26. It is hoped that the report of this Commission will provide the above information which will allow of

a realistic appraisal of the possibility of providing the Bantu part of the Union's population, with a permanent and equitable home in the Bantu Areas.

27. The practicability of the "segregation" formula must be fully investigated and tested out. If, in due course, it is found unpractical, and I greatly fear that it will be found to be so, progressive integration with its economic and political consequences will have to be accepted.

CHAPTER 26

NECESSITY FOR DEVELOPMENT

1. The necessity for the development of the South African Bantu Areas, is related to, and is a function of the socio-economic objectives which are envisaged. Defining criteria for optimum social welfare is difficult, and agreement thereon not easily obtainable, but the following set of objectives will, for the purposes of this discussion, suffice:—

- (i) the achievement of maximum productivity;
- (ii) an "equitable" distribution of the national product;
- (iii) economic stability;
- (iv) political stability; and
- (v) certain other general factors contributing to social welfare, but which do not lend themselves to precise definition.

2. The Bantu Areas are under-developed in the general sense of the term, and it would appear that, from an economic point of view, these areas are sub-marginal. The question as to whether they are in fact or only apparently sub-marginal, can only be answered by an enquiry into the causes of their under-development.

3. The location of a country's economic activities depends partly upon natural factors and partly upon variable factors determined by man. The distribution of the population determines the size of the market and the availability of labour. Once industries have been established, the localisation factor, the so-called "external economies" becomes important. In this way, development itself becomes a function of further development.

4. In South Africa, the latter process is clearly illustrated: With the discovery of gold on the Rand, railways were built from the coast to the Rand and essential services (power, water etc.) were provided, not only in the gold mining centre, but also in the harbour towns which served it. This fact, coupled with the policy of differential railway tariffs, led to the large-scale development of the four main industrial areas: The Southern Transvaal complex, the Western Cape area, the Durban-Pinetown area and the Port Elizabeth

area, with the result (see Chapter 9) that today 32.1 per cent of the Union's population and 83.7 per cent of its net industrial production, are to be found in these four zones.

5. This concentration had the effect of leaving other parts of the country, and especially the Bantu Areas, in a state of comparative under-development, the mobility of Bantu labour being a powerful contributing factor. This mobility is, in turn, attributable to the following circumstances:—

- (i) that the potential of the Bantu Areas, is practically unknown;
- (ii) that the provision of essential services such as railways, power and town planning has been neglected in the Reserves;
- (iii) that the European entrepreneur applied his initiative, capital, skills, etc., outside the Bantu Areas;
- (iv) that the Bantu inhabitants of the Reserves did not possess the necessary initiative, training or organising ability for the efficient development of the resources in these Areas, while the rational exploitation of the available resources has been hampered by their general level of development and their traditional outlook; and
- (v) the general lack of financial resources.

6. These and other factors have impeded the operation of those economic forces which lead to the use of capital and labour in such a way that the marginal product is equal in all parts of the country.

Even if the Bantu Areas are, in fact, sub-economic areas, it should be pointed out that sub-marginality is purely a function of time.

7. The question now arises whether this unbalanced geographic distribution of development, which has left the Bantu Areas in an under-developed state, ought not to be changed.

8. In the first place, consideration must be given to the question of centralisation and its results.

A distinction must be made between place-bound ("plekgebonde") and other undertakings. The former which includes primary and extractive and some secondary industries, are directly or indirectly linked to non-variable factors such as the presence of natural resources. Variable factors, as a supplement to natural factors, partly determine the location of primary concerns and place-bound concerns in secondary industry, and almost entirely, the location of industries that are not place-bound, and tertiary concerns.

9. The Union has entered a new phase of its development, namely an industrial era, as compared with the earlier phase when primary industries (agriculture and mining) were the most important features of our economy. The degree in which the Bantu Areas are to share in future increases of economic activity, in the new industrial era, has to be decided in the light of the desirability of decentralisation instead of centralisation, and in that of the relative suitability of the location of the four zones referred to above.

10. The desirability or otherwise of decentralisation, has often been discussed. Some uncertainty exists about this matter, and there is no clearly formulated national policy in the Union in this connection.

The evils of centralisation were avoided to a considerable degree in the four zones mentioned, by decentralisation within the zones themselves and by the extension of the areas. Serious objections may, however, be raised against the view that the further concentration of economic activities and population has no disadvantages, and should, therefore, not be discouraged. An ever-increasing concentration of population leads to many problems such as increase in the cost of services and land values (which in turn raise the costs of production, housing and transportation), greater vulnerability in some cases, the disutility or cost of noise and smoke, bad housing conditions, military vulnerability, etc.

11. Although the present four industrial areas still represent the most favourable localities from a short-term point of view, from the long-term point of view there are certain objections against the unlimited increase in centralisation of industry within the existing industrial complex. In the Southern Transvaal, there are already signs that the problem of water supply will limit large-scale expansion.

12. Should other parts of the country be considered as new centres of development, the Bantu Areas should certainly be taken into account, on the grounds of their exceptional merits, as discussed in Chapters 34, 35 and 36.

13. The Bantu Areas can and should contribute towards the location of the country's economic activities, and should play a part in the more balanced distribution of these activities. Unless this is done, a vast concentration of people in the existing urban areas may be expected—estimated at 18,000,000 by the end of this century, the greater majority of these in the principal industrial centres; the number of Bantu in these centres will be at least 9,000,000 and may well be 15,000,000.

14. The advantages obtainable from a positive policy of development of the Bantu Areas, may be set out more specifically under the following headings:—

15. *Prevention of further deterioration and destruction of the natural resources.*—It is essential that the available resources be utilised in a more comprehensive and efficient manner, if the standard of living is to be maintained or raised. In previous chapters, the extent to which the resources of the Bantu Areas have been subjected to destruction and deterioration, has been described. Some of these resources may be irretrievably lost, and positive steps for their protection and development are necessary; this is especially true in regard to the soil, water and vegetation. The choice is clearly between rehabilitation and development on the one hand, or destruction and ultimate disappearance of the country's most necessary resources and assets on the other.

16. *Increasing the food production of the Union.*—Having regard to the expected increase in population, the doubt whether the non-Bantu areas will be able to produce sufficient food to meet future demands, the obvious connection between good nutrition and health, and in view of the expected rise in food requirements (owing to changes in ways of living and the raising of the standard of living), the Bantu Areas must be sufficiently developed to enable them to make their proper contribution to the production of food. The undesirability of being dependent upon imports of food, provides an additional reason for such development.

17. *More productive use of Bantu labour.*—Only about 1 per cent of the economically active Bantu are skilled workers, while about 15 per cent are semi-skilled (see Chapter 9). In the Bantu Areas there are only very limited opportunities of employment, hence the large number of migrant labourers periodically absent from the Reserves. In secondary industry, there is a serious shortage of skilled labour, a shortage which may become more pronounced as industry develops. The first question is whether the Bantu might be used in increasing numbers as skilled and semi-skilled workers in the non-Bantu areas. There are serious obstacles and objections to such a course, and it is evident that a considerable shift of Bantu to more skilled occupations could, in the foreseeable future, be brought about only through the large-scale development of the Bantu Areas.

In the second place, the question arises to what extent the available Bantu labour in the Bantu Areas could be advantageously employed. Under present conditions, there is considerable wastage of labour in the Reserves, while the almost unlimited labour supply from within the Bantu Areas, makes it unnecessary for employers outside these Areas, to organise in such a way as to obtain the most economic use of labour. The present wastage and inefficient use of Bantu labour, can only be overcome by the development of the Bantu Areas.

18. *Providing opportunities for free development of the Bantu in the Areas.*—As the Bantu develop, avenues of advancement will have to be made available to them, and planning should be undertaken now, for the provision of such opportunities. Within the present social and economic structure, such opportunities for advancement outside the Bantu Areas can only be

created by State compulsion—a development that is impossible to foresee. The only solution, therefore, appears to lie in creating attractive opportunities for economic development within the Bantu Areas, and, acting on the principle that these areas exist for the Bantu, reserving for them free opportunities of employment in both private and state enterprises established there. Also in the public services and in the political field opportunities could thus be provided for the Bantu in the Reserves—opportunities not available outside.

19. *Raising of the standard of living of the Bantu.*—The present way of life in the Bantu Areas is not such as to ensure in proper measure the physical welfare and intellectual advancement of the population. In future it will be even less adequate. The problem cannot be solved by following a policy aimed at encouraging and facilitating the emigration of the Bantu out of their Reserves. Only the development of the Bantu Areas can ensure the necessary raising of the Bantu standard of living.

20. *Effecting the urbanisation of the Bantu in a healthier and more efficient manner.*—The Bantu population is rapidly becoming urbanised, and such urbanisation will take place at an even faster tempo in the future. Our present pattern of urbanisation exhibits a large number of shortcomings, however, mainly because it does not offer opportunities for the creation of towns which, as complete and self-sufficient centres, could be termed Bantu towns in the first instance. By the development of full-fledged Bantu towns in the Bantu Areas, a more balanced urban structure could be built up in the Union.

21. *The creation of a greater diversity of economic activities for the Bantu in the Areas.*—Apart from wages earned outside the Areas, the most important source of income within the Areas is farming. Diversification of the economy of the Areas must be brought about in order to procure a steady increase in the standard of living of the Bantu.

22. *Development of the Bantu communities on a sound social basis.*—The present system leads to undermining of the Bantu social structure and family life, while the uprooting of individuals and their families from their traditional environments easily leads to a variety of social evils.

23. *Preservation by the Bantu of their cultural identity.*—In developing the Reserves, it will be possible to build upon the best elements of Bantu culture and to strive for enrichment in place of impoverishment of that culture, in the interests of the Bantu and of the country as a whole.

24. *The logical implementation of state policy as laid down in 1913 and 1936.*—The policy of land reservation guaranteed the undisturbed possession of their Areas to the Bantu, but at the same time (considering the exclusion of European private initiative and capital), the duty and responsibility were placed upon the State and the South African people generally, to prevent the deterioration of these Areas, and to bring about their full development, in order to ensure the success of the policy of land reservation and to carry it to its logical conclusion.

25. *The future rôle and place of the Bantu Areas, considered in conjunction with the South African population problem.*—The present and anticipated population structure, with its political implications, and its financial implications in regard to the provision of essential social services for the growing Bantu population, render the intensive development of the Bantu Areas essential; that is to say, the political and social as well as the economic aspects fully justify the development of the Bantu Areas, even though such development might not be financially profitable.

26. *Such development is a condition for political development.*—The socio-economic development of the Bantu Areas, is essential in view of the considerations mentioned in Chapter 25.

27. *As a token of goodwill on the part of the European population.*—A special effort on the part of the European population to develop the Bantu Areas, may well create a spirit of co-operation and harmony in race relations between Europeans and Bantu, and may also produce a better understanding of, and greater confidence in South Africa on the part of other countries.

28. Accepting the necessity for development, the necessity for *planning* such development must now be dealt with briefly. The considerations detailed above, emphasise the need for special efforts and measures, in view of the fact that those employed in the past have proved ineffective. The future development can only be affected on the basis of greater intervention and planning by the State, and increased participation of individual Bantu and of the Bantu communities, and possibly also of individual Europeans, i.e. only by means of purposeful planning. "Absolute" or complete planning is, in the nature of the case, impossible, and the planning will, therefore, always have to be flexible and expanding.

29. Planning is essential because of—

(i) *the nature and scope of the development envisaged for the Bantu Areas, e.g. regarding the provision of essential services, the introduction of a diversified economy, the problems of concentration of industry, the removal of populations and improvement of the standard of living;*

(ii) *the tempo of the proposed development: the rate of development will have to be substantially increased if positive results are to be achieved in regard to diversification of economic activities, the concentration of population in the Bantu Areas, and the standard of living of the inhabitants; and*

(iii) *the methods and machinery required for development: Special techniques and methods will have to be used to carry out the necessary development, and special machinery will have to be devised, since the scope, tempo and method of the development will demand a new approach.*

Planning is also essential in view of the following factors—

(i) *the backward and undeveloped state of the Reserves;*

Collection Number: A1906

Collection Name: Reverend Douglas Chadwick Thompson Papers, 1871-1985

Collection Item: An1 – Summary of the Report of the Commission for the Socio-Economic Development of the Bantu Areas within the Union of South Africa, U.G.61/1955

PUBLISHER:

Publisher: Historical Papers Research Archive, University of the Witwatersrand

Location: Johannesburg

©2015

LEGAL NOTICES:

Copyright Notice: All materials on the Historical Papers website are protected by South African copyright law and may not be reproduced, distributed, transmitted, displayed, or otherwise published in any format, without the prior written permission of the copyright owner.

Disclaimer and Terms of Use: Provided that you maintain all copyright and other notices contained therein, you may download material (one machine readable copy and one print copy per page) for your personal and/or educational non-commercial use only.

People using these records relating to the archives of Historical Papers, The Library, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, are reminded that such records sometimes contain material which is uncorroborated, inaccurate, distorted or untrue. While these digital records are true facsimiles of paper documents and the information contained herein is obtained from sources believed to be accurate and reliable, Historical Papers, University of the Witwatersrand has not independently verified their content. Consequently, the University is not responsible for any errors or omissions and excludes any and all liability for any errors in or omissions from the information on the website or any related information on third party websites accessible from this website.

This document forms part of the Reverend Douglas Chadwick Thompson Papers, held at the Historical Papers Research Archive, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, South Africa.