

the South African, and international cases, is based on its capacity to test the bona fides of applicants. In order to do so, it is necessary that there is both the requisite expertise and representation on the Board. Internationally, the trend has been to include judges, representatives of relevant government departments, representatives of employer, employee and conscientious objector organisations, as well as specific experts such as psychologists and educationalists (125).

It will be necessary that the administration and control of Civilian National Service be approached with a degree of flexibility and initial experimentation until a clear formula for such a Service is established.

#### CONCLUSION: POLICY FRAMEWORK

Civilian National Service as a policy alternative presents itself as a short- to medium-term means of addressing two key policy criteria. These are that:

- \* defence manpower procurement policy must ensure that sufficient force levels are met
- \* the costs of current defence manpower procurement policy must be addressed.

On the basis of the assessments made in this report, the following policy framework is suggested:

- \* It is accepted that the SADF sees the current system of National Service as the most viable means of the SADF attaining its required force levels;
- \* The current system of National Service needs to be developed so as to introduce a Civilian National Service component. Civilian National Service would become a fully-fledged wing of the National Service system and would provide for service in a civilian or non-military capacity;
- \* The system of Civilian National Service should seek to provide a genuine service to the people of South Africa, especially in areas where the need exists;
- \* The system of Civilian National Service should be available to as many conscripts as possible, bearing in mind the Defence Force's requirements;
- \* Three possible approaches to the selection of individuals for Civilian National Service are possible. These are, in order of preference:
  - \* Civilian National Service be available to all conscripts on the basis of choice
  - \* Civilian National Service be available to all conscripts - pacifist as well as non-pacifist - who have genuine moral, ethical or philosophical objections to serving in the SADF

- \* Civilian National Service jobs be set at a certain number for which conscripts would compete.
- \* Civilian National Service should ideally be of the same duration as de facto Military National Service; alternatively, it could be of the same statutory length as Military National Service, viz. two years. A third option could have the Civilian National Service period being set at one-and-a-half times the length as the current effective length of military service, with the proviso that the period be reduced as soon as the defence need can accommodate it. Civilian National Service should be for a continuous period;
- \* Civilian National Service should be carried out in the public and non-profit sectors of the economy. Conscripts performing Civilian National Service would have a choice of jobs and an effort would be made to provide positions which match their skills. Placements in Civilian National Service should be as non-controversial and non-contentious as possible;
- \* Conscripts performing Civilian National Service would receive the same rates of pay as Military National Servicemen. They would be provided with additional allowances for products and services which would be provided free of charge in the Defence Force;
- \* Civilian National Servicemen would not wear military uniforms. They would, where necessary, be required to wear uniforms appropriate to their placement;
- \* Civilian National Service would fall under the administration of the Department of Manpower, or similar non-military government department.
- \* If a process for assessing applicants and jobs were incorporated into policy, a semi-autonomous Board of Control for Civilian National Service would be established. It would control access to the system and assess applications. It would see to the placement of individual conscripts and would review the operation of the System on an ongoing basis. It would be comprised of individuals who have the expertise for the job and are representative of a cross-section of South African society.
- \* It will be necessary to develop a policy response to those individuals who have total objections to all forms of national service.
- \* There is a need to approach the implementation of a system of Civilian National Service with flexibility and openness. There is a need to adopt an approach in which every effort is made to accommodate different interests, and to see the establishment of such a Service as a negotiated process.

## END NOTES

1. Hansard, 1989, Col.5912 The Minister of Defence, General Malan argued that this step was being taken as there were many demands from Citizen Force members and from business to make this change as those eligible for camps play a major role in the economy. Their absence from the workplace for prolonged periods while away on military duty has had a detrimental effect on the economy. It is interesting to note however that in the White Paper on Defence and Armaments Supply, 1986 it was noted that Citizen Force members were only being called up for periods equal to half of that for which they were eligible. The 1989 "change" is therefore a change only to the extent that it turned a de facto situation into a de jure one.
2. See Eberlein
3. The term "blacks" is used in this report to refer to Africans, coloureds and Indians collectively.
4. Section 97 of the Defence Act
5. The Exemption Board is responsible for the deferment from military obligations of students for the duration of their studies.
6. See Section 72 of the Defence Act
7. Since the inception of the Board for Religious Objection in February 1984 until September 1989, there were a total of 1722 successful applications. Of these 334 were for status as non-combatants, 8 for un-uniformed non-combatants, and 1380 non-militarists wishing to perform community service. See Edeling.
8. See Section 16 of the Defence Act.
9. Hansard, 1989, Question 113
10. Finansies en Tegniek, 18 November 1988
11. Cape Times, 30 January 1990. On 1 February 1990 conscientious objector Saul Batsofin was released from prison after serving 9 months of an 18 month sentence. Argus 1 February 1990.

12. Press Release SADF Personnel Division, 19 January 1990.
13. See Malan (1989), Breytenbach (1989), Meyer (1989), Geldenhuys (1989), Nell (1989) and White Paper on Defence and Armaments Supply (1986).
14. According the 1986 Defence White Paper the bulk of the daily defence burden is carried by conscripts. While part-time forces make up the greatest numbers of Defence personnel, 68,1% of the total of soldiers, they only contribute 13,2% of the service rendered. The remaining 86,8% of defence mandays are provided by the Full-time component which comprises the Permanent Force (28,5% of the full-time forces), National Servicemen (48,9%), and volunteers, auxiliaries and civilians (22,6%)
15. The survey of the business and professional communities was conducted among the senior executives of 32 employer organisations, professional bodies, and large employers. See van Dyk. The survey of university academics and administrators was with 128 respondents at all the major South African universities. Particular fields of study which feed the business and professional worlds were focussed on. See Glaser.
16. See Political Costs of Conscription
17. See Shandler (a). The survey was conducted among 464 male students in their final year of study in the following fields: commerce, accountancy, business administration, medicine, engineering, architecture, and computer science. The universities covered were: Witwatersrand, Cape Town, Rhodes, Natal (Pietermaritzburg), Pretoria and Stellenbosch.
18. See Economic Costs of Conscription
19. See van der Merwe
20. See Research Surveys. The survey completed in October 1989 was conducted among 400 white male matriculants who were eligible for National service. 217 were English speaking, with the remainder being afrikaans. 348 attended government schools and 52 attended private schools. The survey was conducted in the PWV area, Bloemfontein, Durban, and Cape Town.
21. The following definition of the current National Service system was used: "Presently all white males over the age of 16 who are South African citizens or residents, have to serve in the SADF for two years".

22. See Unterhalter for an extended discussion of moral and ethical issues related to conscription
23. Ibid
24. See for example the comments of the Director of the South African Institute for Race Relations as quoted in Race Relations Survey 1985
25. Citizen, 8 December 1989
26. Sunday Star, 21 January 1990
27. Paratus, December 1989.
28. This section is based on a survey (Shandler (b)) of thirteen black opinion makers representing all shades of political opinion within the black community. As well as different political views being represented, the respondents also represented different spheres of interest including business, labour, sport, professional, parliamentary and extra-parliamentary spheres. The following is a full list of those interviewed:

Prof. Gerry Coovadia	Natal Indian Congress and National Medical and Dental Association
Dr Ellen Kuzwayo	Soweto People's Delegation
Mr Joe Ebrahim	President, South African Council on Sport
Rev. Sakkie Macazoma	Director of Communications, South African Council of Churches
Mr Moeketsie Shai	Executive Director, Black Management Forum
Mr Harry Gwala	Former Political Prisoner and Member of the African National Congress and South African Communist Party
Mr Tom Boya	President, United Municipalities of South Africa
Dr J.N. Reddy, MP	Leader of the House of Delegates
Mr Laurence Mavundla	President, African Council of Hawkers and Informal Business
Dr Oscar Dhlomo	Minister of Education and Culture, Kwazulu
Mr Sydney Mafumadi	Assistant General-Secretary, Congress of South African Trade Unions
Dr Neville Alexander	Director, South African Council for Higher Education
Mr Aggrey Klaaste	Editor, The Sowetan

29. See Cock
30. See Nathan
31. See Arguments for Conscription above
32. The countries are: Austria, Belgium, Denmark, Finland, France, West Germany, East Germany, Hungary, Italy, Netherlands, Norway, Poland, Portugal, Spain, Sweden, Switzerland and Uruguay.
33. Atkins, p242.
34. See Asher
35. From migration figures provided by Central Statistical Services, Pretoria.
36. This figure is established by determining the surplus of tourists leaving South Africa over those who eventually return. From tourism figures provided by Central Statistical Services.
37. Central Statistical Services
38. See Asher
39. See Asher
40. See Glaser
41. See Van Dyk
42. See Shandler (a)
43. See Bernstein and Adams.
44. See Van der Merwe
45. See Van Dyk. A reason for the perception among those interviewed of a lack of awareness of extensive numbers leaving the country from their particular fields has to do with the nature of those interviewed. All filled senior positions in umbrella organisations and consequently were not in touch with the detail of developments on the ground within their fields. A case study of major accountancy firms showed quite the opposite trend. Here senior executives within firms identified the brain drain as very severe. It is assumed that their "closeness to the ground" allowed for a sharper awareness of developments than was the case amongst senior officers in employer and professional associations.
46. This figure is determined by assuming the discounted incomes of emigrants over their working lives according to income categories.
47. See Asher.

48. This figure was determined according to the rough breakdown that the costs are:
- R 1 000 000 for each economically active individual employed in a lucrative profession;
- R 600 000 for other economically active graduates - except teachers;
- R 350 000 for other economically active individuals.
49. Finance Week, 3 August 1989
50. According to the National Manpower Commission there will be a shortage of approximately 1 100 000 skilled individuals by the turn of the century. This represents a growth in shortages of 3,3% per annum. NMC 1987, p 43.
51. NMC 1987, p13
52. See Glaser
53. See Glaser, van Dyk, and Shandler (a).
54. See Shandler (a)
55. See Bernstein and Adams
56. See Van der Merwe
57. See Shandler (a)
58. See Research Surveys
59. See van Dyk and Glaser
60. See van Dyk
61. See Glaser
62. See Glaser
63. See van Dyk
64. See Glaser
65. See Roux, Pp 4-6
66. Roux, p
67. Van Dyk, Pp 19 - 21
68. 1986 Defence White Paper

69. For a full discussion of issues in the formulation of defence manpower procurement policy, see Cooper, 1982.
70. See Arguments for Conscription
71. DWP/86, p6
72. Roux and Atkins argue that a professional force may be more cost-effective.
73. DWP/86, p 19
74. Strong opposition to the extension of conscription in this way have been voiced by spokesmen for the National People's Party and Solidarity which are represented in the House of Delegates, and by the Labour Party in the House of Representatives. See Race Relations Surveys for 1985, p419 and 1987/8, p513.
75. Shandler (b)
76. See Shandler (a)
77. See Research Surveys. The concept employed in this survey was: "There would be a choice when you are called up which would enable you to do your National Service outside of the Defence Force. This means that you would serve in a civilian role, for example, helping the underprivileged, doing animal welfare work, doing a desk job in a government department, etc."
78. Note: This was a choice between alternative service and the two-year period of military service.
79. See Glaser
80. See Ritchkin. This study focussed on the North Eastern Transvaal, in particular, the Mapulaneng area. Surveys were conducted among workers at a single concern in Bushbuckridge, organisations, experts and important local individuals, Ministers and parliamentarians in Kangwane and Lebowa, and a Johannesburg-based rural development agency.
81. See Shandler (b)
82. See Payne and Fine. The survey investigated the perceptions of public service organisations regarding military service and the concept of Civilian National Service. A public service organisation is defined as an organisation which is involved in some form of community service to the South African public. Public service organisations in both the public and non-profit sectors were surveyed.
83. It is important to note that there was a low response rate to this survey, and that respondents from the public sector were in the main related to black administrations, or parastatals.



84. Roux, p8. This calculation is based on the assumption that the labour value of each participant in such a scheme would on average be approximately R 25 000 to R 30 000 per annum.
85. Glaser
86. van Dyk
87. See Shandler (a)
88. See Section 6. Towards a Policy for Civilian National Service in South Africa.
89. See Payne and Fine
90. See Support for Civilian National Service above
91. See Ritchkin
92. Ritchkin, p8
93. See Shandler (b)
94. Shandler (b), p7
95. See Evans
96. This is an assumption and is open to correction. The SADF does not make public the figure for the number of men not reporting for duty.
97. See Economic Benefits of Civilian National Service above
98. See: Provisions for National Service
99. See Bernstein for a full discussion of the current alternatives available in South Africa.
100. From the Minutes of a Meeting between representatives of the National Community Servers' Group and Representatives of the Department of Manpower, 3/9/87, quoted in Bernstein, p26.
101. See Bernstein and van Dyk.
102. For a detailed description of international provisions see Evans.
103. This principle is contained in the United Nations Declaration of Human Rights, the International Convention on Civil and Political Rights, the European Convention on Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, the American Declaration on the Rights and Duties of Man, the American Convention on Human Rights, and the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights.

104. These countries are: Austria, Belgium, Denmark, Finland, France, West Germany, Hungary, Italy, Netherlands, Norway, Poland, Portugal, and Sweden.
105. These are: East Germany, Switzerland and Uruguay
106. South Africa and Czechoslovakia
107. Argentina, Bulgaria, Greece, Israel, and the USSR
108. Austria, Belgium, Bulgaria, Denmark, Finland, France, West Germany, Italy, Netherlands, Norway, Portugal, Spain, and Sweden.
109. Quoted in Taitz, p249
110. Ibid, p250
111. Roux, pp19-23
112. See Edeling
113. Ibid
114. Shandler (a)
115. Glaser
116. See Research Surveys
117. See Defence White Paper 1986. The reason for the reduced period of actual service is due to Citizen Force members only serving about a half of their commitment due to not being called up, deferments, etc.
118. Shandler (a)
119. See Glaser
120. Payne and Fine
121. Ritchkin
122. Roux, p26
123. See Evans
124. See Shandler (b) and Ritchkin
125. See Evans

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Asher, A.                    The Costs of Emigration, unpublished Research Report, Johannesburg: Centre for Policy Studies, 1989.
- Atkins, B.                    An economic assesment of the costs of conscription as the method of manpower procurement currently employed by the South African Defence Force, unpublished MA dissertation, University of Cape Town, 1987.
- Bernstein, J.                Current systems of alternative service in South Africa, unpublished Research Report, Johannesburg: Centre for Policy Studies, 1989.
- Bernstein, J. and Adams, F. Voting with their Feet: White Students, Conscription and the Brain Drain at Rhodes University, paper delivered at conference, **Association of Sociology of Southern Africa**, 1988.
- Breytenbach, W.    Defence Budget Speech", **Hansard**, 1989.
- Cock, J                        Conscription in South Africa: a Study in the Politics of Coercion, paper delivered at conference, **Association of Sociology of Southern Africa**, 1989.
- Cooper, C et al (eds), **Race Relations Survey 1985**, Johannesburg
- Cooper, C et al (eds), **Race Relations Survey 1987/8**, Johannesburg
- Cooper, R.V.L.            Military Manpower Procurement Policy in the 1980s, Scowcroft, B (ed) **Military Service in the United States**
- Department of Defence, (DWP/86) White Paper on Defence and Armaments Supply (1986)
- Eberlein, Rear Admiral R, The South African Defence Force Perspective, paper delivered at conference, **Centre for Intergroup Studies**, October 1989.
- Edeling, Mr Justice W, The Board for Religious Objection, unpublished conference proceedings, **Centre for Intergroup Studies**, October 1989.
- Evans, G                      Alternative Service - The International Position, unpublished Research Report, Johannesburg: Centre for Policy Studies, 1989.
- Geldenhuis, J.J.    Suidelike Afrika - Die Veiligheidsituasie, paper presented to Symposium, **Human Sciences Research Council**, 1989.
- Glaser, C                      Emigration, Conscription and Alternative Service: A Survey of Training Institutions, unpublished

- Research Report, Johannesburg: Centre for Policy Studies, 1989.
- Malan, M                    Defence Budget Speech, Hansard, 1989.
- Meyer, L.A.                Manpower Requirements of the South African Defence Force to the year 2020, paper presented to Symposium, Human Sciences Research Council, 1989.
- Motshabi, K.              Conscription and Alternative Service in South African Law, unpublished Research Report, Johannesburg: Centre for Policy Studies, 1989.
- Nathan, L.                'Marching to a Different Beat': the History of the End Conscription Campaign, Cock, J and Nathan, L. (eds) War and Society - The Militarisation of South Africa, Cape Town, 1989.
- National Manpower Commission, "High-level and middle-level manpower in South Africa", Pretoria, 1987.
- Nell, D.                    The SADF's need for National Servicemen", paper presented to Symposium, Human Sciences Research Council, 1989.
- Payne, J.R. and Fine, P. Alternative Service and "Public Service Organisations": Perceptions, attitudes and the potential for an alternative form of national service, unpublished Research Report, Johannesburg: Centre for Policy Studies, 1989.
- Project School Management Summary, unpublished Survey Report, Johannesburg: Centre for Policy Studies, 1989.
- Ritchkin, E                Alternative Service and Rural Development: A case study, unpublished Research Report, Johannesburg: Centre for Policy Studies, 1989.
- Roux, A (in association with Black,P, McCarthy,C, Loots,L, Moll,P, and Donaldson, A)            The Economics of Alternative Service, unpublished Research Report, Johannesburg: Centre for Policy Studies, 1989.
- Shandler, D.              Conscription, Alternative Service and Emigration: A Survey of White Male Students in Key Fields of Study, unpublished Research Report, Johannesburg: Centre for Policy Studies, 1989.
- Shandler, D.              Teachers before Soldiers: Conscription, Alternative Service and the Black Community - A Survey of Selected Black Opinion Makers, unpublished Research Report, Johannesburg: Centre for Policy Studies, 1989.

- Taitz, J.                   Conscription, religious objectors and the 'Board for Religious Objection', in *De Jure*, p 239, 1988.
- Unterhalter, D.           A view from within: secondment and its entailments for a system of national service that is efficient and equitable, paper delivered to conference, *Centre for Intergroup Studies*, October 1989.
- Van der Merwe, H.       Alternative National Service - the need for and effect of a change in legislation, African Studies Honours Dissertation, University of Cape Town, 1988.
- van Dyk, H.               Manpower, Compulsory Military Service and Alternative National Service: Views of a group of representatives of key employer and professional organisations, unpublished Research Report, Johannesburg: Centre for Policy Studies, 1989.

## APPENDIX ONE

### A DESCRIPTION OF THE ALTERNATIVE NATIONAL SERVICE RESEARCH PROJECT

The Alternative National Service Research Project was established at the Centre for Policy Studies in September 1988. The purpose of the project was to investigate the current system of National Service and the hypothesis that a system of Civilian National Service may serve as a viable policy response to the current limits of conscription.

The focus of the research fell on investigating manpower and economic issues, although not to the exclusion of political aspects. As a policy research project the aim of the work was to formulate policy proposals on the issue of National Service.

The research covered issues relating to current policy, the nature of current National Service, its limits and possibilities, as well as a range of issues related to alternative policy.

A team of researchers was retained to conduct the research. The following is a list of the research areas, and the researchers responsible for them:

The Extent and Cost of the Brain Drain	Prof. Anthony Asher, University of the Witwatersrand
A Survey of attitudes regarding Emigration, Conscription and Alternative Service in the Business and Professional Communities	Hanlie van Dyk, Centre for Policy Studies
A Survey of attitudes regarding Emigration, Conscription and Alternative Service among staff at Tertiary Training Institutions	Clive Glaser
A Survey of attitudes regarding Emigration, Conscription and Alternative Service among Final Year Male Students	Research Surveys (Pty) Ltd and David Shandler
A Survey of Attitudes regarding Conscription and Alternative National Service among Male Matric Pupils	Research Surveys (Pty) Ltd
An International Comparative Study of Conscription and Alternative Forms of Service	Gavin Evans

A Case Study for a Possible Civilian National Service Scheme in the North Eastern Transvaal

Edwin Ritchkin

The Economics of Alternative Service

Prof Andre Roux  
(University of the Western Cape), in association with Prof. P Black (University of Stellenbosch),  
Prof C McCarthy  
(University of Stellenbosch),  
Prof. L. Loots  
(University of the Western Cape), Dr P Moll  
(University of Cape Town), and  
A Donaldson  
(Rhodes University)

A Survey of attitudes regarding Emigration, Conscription and Alternative Service among Public Service Organisations

Roddy Payne and Pam Fine

Conscription and Alternative Service in South African Law

Khanya Motshabi,  
University of the  
Witwatersrand

Current Systems of Alternative Service in South Africa

Jeremy Bernstein

A Survey of attitudes regarding Emigration, Conscription and Alternative Service among Selected Black Opinion Makers

David Shandler

Supervision of the project was provided by a Management Committee which was comprised of:

Mr David Shandler	(Project Leader)
Mr Mark Swilling	Research Officer, Centre for Policy Studies, University of the Witwatersrand
Mr Mark Philips	Researcher, Centre for Policy Studies
Dr Jacky Cock	Senior Lecturer, Department of Sociology, University of the Witwatersrand
Mr Roland White	Research Officer, Urban Foundation
Mr Roddy Payne	Researcher, Urban Research Services
Dr Robin Lee	Senior Research Fellow, Centre for Policy Studies

An Academic Reference Group provided a referencing service. They assessed the research papers and were not responsible for the final policies suggested. This group was made up of:

Prof. Lawrie Schlemmer	Director, Centre for Policy Studies
Prof. Mervyn Shear	Deputy Vice-Chancellor, University of the Witwatersrand
Prof. June Sinclair	Dean, Faculty of Law, University of the Witwatersrand
Prof. Ettiene Mureinik	Head, School of Law, University of the Witwatersrand
Prof. Eddie Webster	Head, Department of Sociology, University of the Witwatersrand
Prof. Brian McKendrick	Head, School of Social Work, University of the Witwatersrand
Prof. Van Zyl Slabbert	Associate Professor, Graduate School of Business Administration, University of the Witwatersrand
Dr Robin Lee	Senior Research Fellow, Centre for Policy Studies
Mr Fuaad Cassim	Lecturer, Department of Economics, University of the Witwatersrand
Mr Nic Binnedel	Lecturer, Graduate School of Business Administration, University of the Witwatersrand
Mr Cedric de Beer	Co-Director, Centre for the Study of Health Policy, University of the Witwatersrand
Mr Edwin Cameron	Lecturer, Centre for Applied Legal studies, University of the Witwatersrand
Mr David Unterhalter	Special Assistant to the Managing-Director, Small Business Development Corporation

In addition, the following also refereed papers:

Dr Charles Simkins	Economist, Urban Foundation
Mr Mike Sarakinsky	Lecturer, Department of Sociology, University of the Witwatersrand
Mr Steve de Gruchy	Chaplain undergoing Community Service, Groote Schuur Hospital, Cape Town
Mr Mark Addleson	Lecturer, Graduate School of Business Administration, University of the Witwatersrand

It should be noted than an attempt was made to compare research findings with the South African Defence Force, but this was not possible as material held by the Defence Force is confidential and for its internal use only.



**Collection Number: AG1977**

**END CONSCRIPTION CAMPAIGN (ECC)**

**PUBLISHER:**

*Publisher:- Historical Papers Research Archive*

*Location:- Johannesburg*

©2013

**LEGAL NOTICES:**

**Copyright Notice:** All materials on the Historical Papers website are protected by South African copyright law and may not be reproduced, distributed, transmitted, displayed, or otherwise published in any format, without the prior written permission of the copyright owner.

**Disclaimer and Terms of Use:** Provided that you maintain all copyright and other notices contained therein, you may download material (one machine readable copy and one print copy per page) for your personal and/or educational non-commercial use only.

People using these records relating to the archives of Historical Papers, The Library, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, are reminded that such records sometimes contain material which is uncorroborated, inaccurate, distorted or untrue. While these digital records are true facsimiles of paper documents and the information contained herein is obtained from sources believed to be accurate and reliable, Historical Papers, University of the Witwatersrand has not independently verified their content. Consequently, the University is not responsible for any errors or omissions and excludes any and all liability for any errors in or omissions from the information on the website or any related information on third party websites accessible from this website.

This document is part of a collection held at the Historical Papers Research Archive at The University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, South Africa.