

powers or the duties of chiefs. Their honourable position among their own people is as assured as is that of a Highland chieftain or an English peer to-day." But in England and in Scotland the chieftains in the latter and the peers in the former have large tracts of land that they keep to themselves. As you know, in the earlier days the whole land belonged to the chief in Scotland ?--- Yes.

And I think in the feudal system it belonged to the peer. How would you deal with the chief here in this country: how would you ensure that he would have a position socially? Would the Government give him a salary, or would he possess a portion of land ?--- I think it might well be considered that if a tribal location is being broken up into individual holdings, the chief's holding should be considerably larger than that of the commoner. At the same time I would stress that affection and respect for chiefs would not depend on that. I mean, you have given an example of Scotland: you take the position after 1845 in Scotland, when most of the chiefs were dispossessed of their land. But it made absolutely no difference to their influence among the people with whom they were living.

That would not happen to-day ?--- No, it would not happen to-day.

Nor to any of the peers. If the Duke of Norfolk were hard up, I am quite sure his people would not come and give him a shilling ?--- He would still have a greater opportunity of getting on the directorate of a company than if he were plain Mr Howard.

I think it would be better if you could indicate some permanent source of wealth or money which would give him dignity and station ?--- I think naturally the chief has that. The only thing would be that if by taking away the



tribal lands and his position, he was reduced to the common level, I think it would probably be a mistake if in any subdivision of the tribal lands he should not be given a larger share for himself.

You know it yourself, you have the descendants of Gaika and Sandele (?) doing work on the roads at 1s/6d a day. That should not be, and if something is not done, that might happen to all the chiefs. Then, also on page three, (8): "I wish to emphasise the growth of cohabitation without marriage in our town locations, its dangers and the hardship to the woman and her children when they are abandoned, as so often happens." Do you think there is much of that?--- There is no question about it. I am speaking of experience in the Pretoria location, but I think most missionaries and others who are working in town locations would substantiate that.

But, as you say further on, that naturally must happen from bringing in single women and single ~~wen~~ men?--- Again our evidence does hang together on that point. It is a question of having more families that work in the urban areas.

You say the experience of the West Indies has been very similar. Are you meaning Jamaica?--- Well, Jamaica was what I had particularly in mind, but I don't think the phenomenon is confined to Jamaica.

Only there you consider it is worse: you think it is worse?--- I am sorry I haven't got too good a head for statistics, but I think the number is 75 per cent of illegitimate births in Jamaica, technically illegitimate. And I was told by someone who has lived there that when a baptism takes place in a church, as the result of a real marriage,

/ the church



the church now has gone to the trouble to get a kind of higher status, and rather calmly rides over the other baptisms, in order to make a difference between the two.

In the worst of our towns, like Grahamstown and some of the other towns, it does not reach 50 per cent - the number of illegitimate children ...

THE CHAIRMAN : 55 per cent was quoted to us at East London ?--- When I say "illegitimate births" in speaking of the West Indies, I am not of course implying that the negro population is living in a state of promiscuity. The majority of those are what one would call common-law marriages: the men and women have been living together for years, and it is often the case in our locations, too. But the trouble is there is no remedy when the man suddenly walks off and leaves the woman.

DR ROBERTS : But we have a remedy by law in this country, haven't we ?--- Have we ?

I think so. No man can leave a woman and a family, and march out ....

MR LUCAS : Legally he is bound to support them. In practice it is very difficult to enforce, in a number of instances ?--- Wouldn't it be very expensive for a native -- that remedy ? I have never heard of a legal remedy being found for these actual cases that arise. Surely the Sub-Native Commissioners ought to be advised if there is such a remedy ?

The difficulty is arising this way, that the Native Commissioners or the Native Appeal Court is holding that these natives are subject to tribal law, and the tribal law says that anything of that sort is met by giving a beast, which is not very much remedy for a woman trying to maintain a baby in a town ?--- It is not very good tribal law either,

/ because



because in the case of Wuzihlangu vs. Batshise, the Native High Court had to deal with just that case of long continued cohabitation without the passing of a beast under tribal law, and it held that it constituted marriage.

I was thinking more of the case of living together, cohabitation for only a short time; but that is one of the difficulties that is arising from the application of tribal law to natives in towns ?--- Yes, it is one of the points I have made later on. I think we are going much too far in that direction.

DR ROBERTS : On the same page, 6 (14): "There has undoubtedly been a growth of economic needs, inadequately accompanied by a rise of wages." That is, the demands and needs of the natives, in ratio, have gone up steadily ?--- Yes.

The one is greater than the other ?--- Yes.

Do you consider that his demands are reasonable, if they have grown beyond his wages ? That might happen even to a professor ?--- It is an awfully hard question to answer. You might ask whether the hire purchase motor car basis of our white civilisation is reasonable. It would be a similar question.

This is the most important part of this page: "Natives are worse off than they were twenty-five years ago." You really think that ?--- Yes, I really think so. I think they are worse off in this position, from this point of view: they are now less able to obtain what they consider to be their needs. That is all. I don't think they are worse off in the long run. It may be an inevitable process, a stumble upward; but they are worse off from that point of view.

That brings us back to the question I put to you: do

/ you



you think their needs are reasonable - these needs that make their condition worse ?--- Yes. I am afraid I must candidly say it is very difficult to answer. For instance, there is no doubt that recreation looms very large in the mind of a town native to-day. One of the things that makes us despair, for instance -- those of us who are interested in native welfare -- is that when we are trying to bring home to people how much the native is in want of the simple necessities of life, he is able to find a shilling or two shillings to go along to a bioscope or a dance. But we know that that is the case amongst the poorer classes in most countries: recreation and funerals are the most expensive things .

(Professor Frankel): There is no doubt that their needs are actually greater, quite apart from how one may judge them in a town. For urban employment they have to dress in a different way; they have to be housed in a different way; they have transport costs which they don't have when they work on a farm; and their recreation must be of a different nature.

Then, Professor Brookes, you touch on a very important matter on page four, namely, the position, and the independence, and the forward movement, among women. Have you met many of the native women leaders ?--- I have not met many of them personally, not in the same way as the men. But I would like to stress a point there - it is very interesting but quite true - that in Pretoria women are beginning, ever since the Women's Enfranchisement Act was passed, the native women are beginning to attend political meetings, right-away from the beginning. On our Joint Council we get the women too; we now have an average of from six to ten every meeting; public meetings, the same.

/ I don't



I don't know if you are aware of this, that at the big institutions women attend the various literary societies and take a very prominent place ?--- So I understand.

And speaking with force, taking sides in debates, which of course they could not do before. And I noticed in your Bantu club, you had women in the club ?--- Yes.

There is no objection to that, is there ?--- No. We tried in our Joint Council in Pretoria to form a separate Women's Joint Council, but neither the women nor the men would have it.

You find the same thing in Queenstown and elsewhere: they have got native women on their council. Do you think the women are playing a larger part than previously ?--- I think so.

And then do you think that the old relationship, that operates in the lower classes in England and Scotland, is passing ?--- That is passing. As I have stated in my "History of Native Policy" I think the two first blows dealt at it were the missionary work, and secondly the plough. The introduction of the plough definitely meant that the women took a step upward. That is one of the biggest things we have given them, really.

You put this down also to the individualistic outlook, I see ?--- In modern times in town life I attribute it more to the reasons which I have given here on this page four.

You think developments in South Africa are moving in the same direction as you found in the Southern States of America. Do you think that is a good thing ?--- I am not sure. I think it is inevitable; I am not sure if it is good.

MR LUCAS : It is up to us to make it good ?--- Yes. I don't think it is a process that we can alter.

DR ROBERTS : You think not ?--- I don't think so.

/ MR LUCAS :



MR LUCAS : Is that the alternative between the communal system in the rest of Africa, and our own individualistic system ?--- Yes. I think we cannot hope, unless we can carry out a very thorough going scheme of segregation, to check that process.

DR ROBERTS : Does it leave a comfortable feeling in your mind - you have seen the Southern States ?--- Yes, on the whole it does. I mean, if we were not here, I am not sure if I would deliberately introduce so large a number of Europeans into a native community for their good; but as we are here, I don't think there is any reason to feel pessimistic. I mean, the condition of the Southern States is bad from some points of view, but economically the negro has a much better chance than the native has here, up to the present. (Professor Frankel): If I might just put in a word here - a point I noticed in the previous evidence of Professor Macmillan on this point: there is no need to stress the word individualistic to the full extent we talk about it to-day. European society itself is working towards far greater co-operative effort; it does not mean extreme competition regardless of what happens to the individual.

DR FOURIE : Negroes had no tribal system of their own; they were individuals, for themselves ?--- (Professor Brookes): Yes.

They had not a tribal system ?--- That is of course naturally a very big difference, but the point is not only our towns but our farms are completely breaking down the tribal system.

DR ROBERTS : Still you could not have the council system among negroes; I could not conceive of it such as you have in the Transkei ?--- I don't see why you could not,

/ if you



if you had a negro county with only negroes in it; you could very easily have a Negro County Council in the States, which would work quite well.

Don't you think they are too individualistic ?--- I don't of course mean to suggest, Dr Roberts, that we will get an exact copy of the Southern States; but I mean we would be much more like them than we would be, for example, like Tanganyika. I hope we will conserve anything that is good in the social outlook of the Bantu. I don't want just to see it broken down, but we cannot hide the fact from ourselves that the tribal system is crumbling.

A movement, as you know, even among natives - I mean incorporated with Europeans - as you have got it in the Ciskei, is to form natives into a separate council, even there ?--- Yes.

That would not be possible if we were to move in the direction of the Southern States ?--- I am not in this way arguing against the council system. I think in an area like the Ciskei separate councils are for our time the only means of educating natives in local government, and therefore they are a good thing. I would like to add the proviso that you may not have separate councils in an area like that in one hundred years' time.

In paragraph (15) you say "Bioscopes, including 'talkies', are well patronised. At dances, the latest steps used in European ball-rooms can be seen." Now when I was in Durban I went with Mr Champion to see one of these dances. It is quite true, what you say, that the latest steps used in European ball-rooms could be seen. Well, I thought it was about the weakest thing ever I saw ?--- I am trying to speak quite objectively here. I don't say the latest steps in European ball-rooms are good; I have no opinion on the



point, not being a dancer.

Well, I think I would prevent it, knowing what the native is. It may be all right tribally, but it is not suited for European dances ?--- But how would you be able to prevent it ? I know I ought not to question you.

I would not like to make it legal, but I think I would make it tribal - unless you can rid him of all his natural and native thoughts and ways ?--- Is it not in a sense a return of a compliment ? We have taken over most of these dance steps from negro sources ourselves.

The bulk of us don't dance them, the better-class of people ?--- I must naturally defer to your superior experience on that point.

Now I felt very keenly when I went to that Durban place, that the whole thing was wrong ?--- I don't think their own dances lead to more immoral results than the European dances.

Now you say, "Marcus Garvey's journal has had a wide sale." Is that "The African World" ?--- Yes.

Has it really a wide sale ?--- Yes. I saw it being sold openly by a newsboy in the location.

An official told me that the numbers were fewer. You don't know of that ?--- I could not say. That is quite possible.

He has fallen in repute, has he not, with the natives here -- Marcus Garvey ?--- I think they have become rather bored with him.

On page six you dwell upon the fact that our Report may be an excellent thing when it comes out, but cannot be regarded as final, and at the top there, you plead for a permanent native economic survey. Is that in connection with the Chairman's office ?--- I should think that would be a

/ very



very happy arrangement. I had not really thought it out in detail.

Or would you have it in connection with the Native Affairs Department, because it is of some importance?--- Of course I think we really ought to have a general economic survey including natives, and from that point of view I would rather see it under what seems at first hearing to be the most suitable Department, the Census Department, rather than the Native Affairs.

MR LUCAS : Would not it be a mistake just to do it for natives? One of the points that struck me is the impossibility of separating the Indians of Natal or the coloured people in the Cape when you are looking for social and economic conditions as affecting the native?--- That is so. I think it is a lapsus linguae, or rather a lapsus stilli here. I should have left out "native". The whole trend of our evidence is to show the interaction.

DR ROBERTS : In the middle of the page you say the Report of the Commission cannot be regarded as final. Of course nothing in life can be regarded as final?--- That is so. But such hope has been built by the public on this Commission that there might be a tendency to think of it as an exception.

Then you refer to the census. Do you know if you are expressing a common idea here in the regret that the native census was not proceeded with?--- As far as I can judge there seems to be, among those who have thought about it, a ve\_ry general consensus of opinion on those lines. I was myself mildly surprised to find that, after not being asked to give information about my native servants, I had forms to give information about ostriches.

MR LUCAS : To illustrate some of the difficulties that we are faced with through not having a census generally



it is true, I think, that there has been a big influx into the towns; but when you look at the figures for Maritzburg, which has taken a census every year for some time for its own purposes, the influx is not over-rated. <sup>great</sup> It may be that the same will be true of quite a number of towns which speak about the serious influx of natives. There is no means of checking it without a census ?--- Quite so. I was feeling that from the point of view of any one studying this subject, and particularly from the point of view of a Commission like this, so many of these questions that you ask us I could not answer. The last available figures were 1921. I suppose you would have to ask for all the figures you can get, but still the point is clear, it is a great loss to the work of a Commission like this.

(Professor Frankel): I hope that the Commission will adequately protest against what I call a real blow to its usefulness - one of the most unfair blows that I think any Commission doing its duty could have expected from any Government. It is putting it perhaps strongly, but I think it adequately covers what is almost a crime, when you are spending so much money on a Commission.

THE CHAIRMAN : I think there is the possibility that the Minister who stopped it regretted it more than anybody else ?--- Yes, I suppose there is. (Professor Brookes): It is like the difference between remorse and repentance: it was not followed by good works.

(Professor Frankel): I would like to say I don't think any Minister who had adequately given attention to the principle of maximum social benefit could have possibly economised in that extremely regrettable direction.

DR ROBERTS : Professor Brookes, on page nine (19) you say "Little provision is made by employers for the

/ recreation



recreation of their native employees." Is there any at all ?--- (Professor Brookes): Well, I believe the Chamber of Mines is doing something, but I was of course speaking of Pretoria. I did not like to make the unqualified statement that no provision is made, because of exceptional cases like that.

Very little ?--- Yes.

Apart from what these excellent men are doing in Johannesburg, I know of nothing myself done by employers for their native workmen ....

THE CHAIRMAN : Is it the practice at all in South Africa for employers to go in for that sort of thing ?--- It is in no way the practice. I only know straight-off of the Chamber of Mines, but I imagine that there are some employers who take steps in that direction.

It is a thing which is new in England and Europe generally - only in the case of very large factories ?--- Yes. I was not saying that with any intention of condemning employers. The question put was whether I knew of instances.

DR ROBERTS : In England we have a set of circumstances very different from here. Your native cannot enter into a public park and play football in this country, and therefore the necessity of the employer finding recreation for him is very much greater. In England and Scotland the employee can enter any park ?--- Yes. Someone has to take the initiative; it may possibly be the duty of the municipality, but it certainly would be an excellent thing if employers could do more.

At the bottom of page nine you refer again to the disadvantage of men being absent from their homes. Do you think there is any effect upon the families, upon the conduct of the boys and the girls ? Take the conduct, first

/ of all



of all: when the father is away, has it any effect on the children? Are they more troublesome?--- Undoubtedly it has an effect.

Has it any effect upon their physical up-bringing: are they weaker?--- That is rather difficult to say. On the whole I should say "Yes," with the absence of the wage earner. If he sends his wages home, it ought to have a contrary effect, which it does not always.

Now I would like you to answer something on page ten that has always been of the greatest wonder to me. "On the other hand, town life has some good effects on such natives. In many cases it leads to a nominal, and in some cases to a very real Christianity." Now have you any explanation to give why Christianity is making such slight headway in the Native Territories, making none practically?--- I am afraid my explanation would perhaps be a little too theological for the Commission.

There are one or two of us who try to understand! ?--- Well, Dr Roberts, in that case I will so far condescend as to say that I think you have not got in many of the country districts the same fervent type of zealous missionary that you had in the early days. That is all. In short, the Church is in need of a revival, but I hardly think it would come within your terms of reference, although I have no doubt you could follow it up.

It has a distinct bearing on the character of the natives, for the moment you bring in Christianity, the tribal system goes, practically?--- Yes, that is the practical position in South Africa; I believe not in East Africa.

But it is here?--- Yes.

Now might it be this, because this comes within our terms of reference, that the inclination of the native

/ living



living in the Territories is still to hold on to the tribal system ?--- That of course does operate in some parts very strongly, but I don't think it is the main difficulty in the way of missionary success.

You don't think so ?--- I think the main difficulty in the way of missionary success is partly that missionaries are not always as zealous as they used to be, and secondly that what the native has seen of practical Christianity is not always such as to commend it to him.

But he has always his own weak brothers - white brothers; the weak ones you have always had with you, like the poor ?--- But it takes some time for the full extent of disillusionment to come.

And you have in the towns very zealous workers like some of those you mentioned; you have in the towns much more zealous workers than you have in the country ?--- I am not sure if that is a fair statement for me to make. I don't mean that there are not zealous workers in the country; I mean that the first flush of enthusiasm from the body as a whole, seems to have died down for a time.

On page 11 (a) -- we need not go over all the remedies -- you put in the forefront the development of native agriculture. You think that would take the first place ?--- I put it in the forefront because I think it is the least contentious of all the suggestions, that everybody could agree with that, whatever their point of view was. I don't necessarily say it is the most important.

Coming on to page 15, following on what you give there as proposals, you say, "The chief obstacles in the way of making further openings for educated natives are, the unenlightened state of Europeans as to the probable economic and

/ social



social effects on the community of further native advance," and a little further on you refer to the race feeling. How would you get rid of that? Do you see any way by which you could lessen this race dislike, the real dislike that many Europeans have for the native?--- Well, I do feel that it is not something which we have to accept as inevitable for all time; that is to say, I don't think it is inherently so great as is sometimes alleged; for many reasons. One is because we don't find it among children, up to a certain age.

The children haven't got any dislike for their native nurse, for example?--- No; nor for playing with other native children. And also it must be admitted that the theory of physical repugnance, actual physical repugnance, is not borne out by the practice of miscegenation, often on the part of men who in theory are very strongly prejudiced. I think by a very slow -- I am afraid it will have to be: I wish it did not have to be -- a very slow process of education, in every possible agency, we shall gradually break it down. The feeling, as far as it is not merely prejudice, if there is any reason behind it, well and good; but we at least want to get rid of the prejudice, and I think we can.

How would you explain the feeling of the Anglo-Saxon people in comparison with the Latin races: does that come from the old Roman days?--- I think it is to be explained very largely, in so far as it is true -- I think it is exaggerated, because there has been a tremendous amount of race mixture between Anglo-Saxon people, outside the law; but so far as there is a difference, I think it is to be explained by the Roman tradition, and by the tradition of the Roman Catholic Church, which does not encourage national feeling.

And the old Roman idea that there was no difference,

/ because



because they had black emperors ?--- Yes.

With regard to page 16, you say, "I think the time is over-ripe for the creation of a blanket factory in the Transkei." But do you think you would be able to sell, that people would buy that blanket rather than get a cheap one from Home ?--- I take it if we can protect our boot and shoe factories as actively as we have done, we can also protect our blanket factories. Is not the present duty in itself a tremendous protection to any local industry ?

MR LUCAS : Yes: it is reducing the importation very considerably ?--- Yes.

DR ROBERTS : And you think a blanket factory would do the same thing ?--- I don't say it would be a good thing, but the question asked was whether I could think of anything practicable. If we are going to adopt the policy of trying to keep the native out of skilled industry, the corollary would be to give him skilled employment in his own areas.

DR ROBERTS : It would be a good thing, you think, to have a factory for him ?--- I should think it would be a very interesting and useful experiment. It could be no more than that.

Have you any ideas as to how it could be started ? Would it have to be a State-aided thing ?--- I think it would have to be a Council-aided thing. I think if the Bunga were given encouragement to do it, it would do it.

MR LUCAS : Supposing that something of that sort were started, would not there be a very big opposition from the Europeans who are already in this industry in other parts of the country ? Might not there be a claim for protection against the native-produced goods ?--- There might be opposition, but there could be no fair claim.

I am not talking about fairness for the moment: I



am talking about the obstacles that would have to be dealt with if such a policy were adopted ?--- Something would have to be done; it seems so horribly unfair to leave this duty on blankets, which are bought almost exclusively by natives, and to keep them out of skilled work in the factory where these blankets are made. Surely they should have a chance to make the blankets themselves.

I believe there are no natives employed in this industry at all, except a few people to scrub floors ?---  
(No reply.)

THE CHAIRMAN : On page 13 you refer to a native company starting business as a registry office. I take it that is this Bantu Employment Bureau ?--- That is right.

Could you tell the Commission whether this is exclusively run by natives ?--- Well, I can only answer that as far as I know. I know of no whites or white influence behind it, but I am not prepared to say that there is not any.

What I would like to know whether there may not be white people deriving a pecuniary interest from it ?--- I will try to find that out and advise the Commission.

MR LUCAS : And in the interests of the natives you might see whether they are observing the provisions about registry offices under the Industrial Conciliation Act ?---  
Thank you.

DR ROBERTS : Now you deal with the Land Act and the Mines and Works Act: on page 18, about eight lines from the bottom, I gather from your remarks here that you are against the system of legislation by proclamation ...

MR LUCAS : Only without proper safeguards ?--- No: I am in favour of the system of legislation by proclamation, provided there are adequate safeguards.

DR ROBERTS : What do you consider are safeguards ?---  
I am pointing out here one particular extract by which the



**Collection Number: AD1438**

**NATIVE ECONOMIC COMMISSION 1930-1932, Evidence and Memoranda**

**PUBLISHER:**

*Collection funder:- Atlantic Philanthropies Foundation*

*Publisher:- Historical Papers Research Archive*

*Location:- Johannesburg*

©2013

**LEGAL NOTICES:**

**Copyright Notice:** All materials on the Historical Papers website are protected by South African copyright law and may not be reproduced, distributed, transmitted, displayed, or otherwise published in any format, without the prior written permission of the copyright owner.

**Disclaimer and Terms of Use:** Provided that you maintain all copyright and other notices contained therein, you may download material (one machine readable copy and one print copy per page) for your personal and/or educational non-commercial use only.

People using these records relating to the archives of Historical Papers, The Library, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, are reminded that such records sometimes contain material which is uncorroborated, inaccurate, distorted or untrue. While these digital records are true facsimiles of paper documents and the information contained herein is obtained from sources believed to be accurate and reliable, Historical Papers, University of the Witwatersrand has not independently verified their content. Consequently, the University is not responsible for any errors or omissions and excludes any and all liability for any errors in or omissions from the information on the website or any related information on third party websites accessible from this website.

This document is part of the archive of the South African Institute of Race Relations, held at the Historical Papers Research Archive at the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, South Africa.