

MEMORANDUM RE DETECTIVE CONSTABLE HATTINGH.

This witness, when reporting in the Afrikaans language, appears to record speeches quite well. When reporting in English he is very bad. He is obviously not at home in the English language and it is clear that much that he has written is quite unintelligible both to him and to readers of his reports.

For examples of such ungrammatical and unintelligible (and unintelligent) reporting, see Vol. 11, pp. 2143, 2144, 2149, 2150, 2152, 2153 & 2154, 2155, 2156 & 2157, 2157, 2159, 2162. These references are all to Meeting No. 39.

See also in Vol. 14, p. 2795, 2799 and 2800 and 2802, 2801, 2802 & 2803, 2808.

Furthermore, you ^{me} should also compare Hattings's recording of the same speech, No. 116, reported at p.2791, Vol. 14, with that of Solomon Dungs. For cross-examination thereon, see pp. 2805, 2806, 2807 and 2809, V. 15. Attention is drawn to the differences in the recording of this speech.

Hattings also states that when dealing with a lengthy English sentence, he abbreviates it and records it in Afrikaans. See p. 2804, V.15.

Hattings should also be asked why, when the vernacular is used, he translates this himself into Afrikaans and so records it, instead of recording the English interpretation which the interpreter at the meeting announced to their audience. See 1852, V.11, 2151, V.11, 2160, V.11.

In a dogmatic manner characteristic of this witness,

Hattings/...

Hattingh was not at first prepared to admit that he misses a great deal of what is said by the speakers, but he later concedes this on a number of occasions. See V.10, p.1853, 1855, V.11, p.2158, 2159, 2164, V.14, p. 2795, 2796, 2797, V.15, p. 2801, 2804, 2810.

This witness is referred to twice by Adv. Pirow in his address at the preparatory examination, and extracts from the witness's recording deal with the two following themes, "the object is a People's Democracy", and "instilling race hostility". See Coaker's note on Pirow's speech, at pp. 2 - 12.

An examination of the meetings recorded by Hattingh reveals interesting and highly suspicious circumstances. Both meetings, i.e. Nos. 39 and 116 of the 28/11/54 and 2/11/54, reported at p. 2142 V.11, and 2791, V.14 respectively, are recorded in the English language. These two meetings are recorded in a highly ungrammatical manner, they are full of nonsense, incomplete and unintelligible.

Speech No. 537 of 11/4/54 reported at p. 7876, V. 40, reported in the Afrikaans language is in a completely different category. It is coherent, grammatical, sensible and contains no patent omissions.

Attention, however, is drawn to the fact that meeting No. 10 of 2/5/54, reported at p. 1789, V.9, and at 1846 V.10, is reported in English, and unlike the two English meetings above referred to, namely Meetings Nos. 39 and 116, it is quite grammatical and sensible and on the face of it the reporting contains nothing to which exception can be taken from the point of view of obvious omissions/...

omissions, bad grammar and unintelligibility.

The witness should be cross-examined and asked to explain this peculiarity and inconsistency in the reporting of this speech. I think it is fairly obvious that the truth is that, reporting in his own language, i.e. Afrikaans, Hattingh is quite good and at home, but when reporting in the English language he is at a disadvantage because of his poor knowledge of the language. The only conclusion to be drawn is that speech No. 10 of 2/5/54 reported at 1789, V.9., in such a grammatical and intelligible form was not recorded by Hattingh at all - or if it was, he was given assistance after the meeting to enable him to polish up his recording and furnish a grammatical and sensible report.

N.B. (a). Hattingh's original notes referring to Meeting No. 10 have not been produced.
See p. 1789, V.9.

(b). The accused alleged that the said meeting No.10 was attended by a shorthand writer. Hattingh, after much hesitation, conceded that a shorthand writer may have attended.
See p. 1847 & 8, V.10.

Possibly Hattingh compiled his report from the shorthand writer's notes or with the latter's assistance, but I think that Hattingh will find it very difficult to explain the obvious and startling differences in his recordings.

Attention is drawn to p. 2145, V.11, where a reference is made to fire-arms. Hattingh should be cross-examined in order to obtain the concession that

if/...

if something is recorded out of its context, or is something that is said by a speaker is omitted, then what is recorded can become meaningless and misleading. As an example, the sentence "give us money to buy fir-arms rifles" can mean something quite different if preceded by the sentence "the police have rifles, but our rifles are our unity, our brains and our mouths".

The theme of non-violence, racial amity, repudiation of the Cheesa Cheesa movement, the denial of the existence of any Mau Mau organisation in the Union, should be put to Hattingh.

In this respect attention is drawn to the following quotations taken out of Hattingh's notes:

"We must repeat the Defiance Campaign, that is the spirit which will liberate the people". (p.1791, V.9, Kathrada).

"Our force is the force of our labour" (p. 1792, V.9, Kathrada).

"We want peace and happiness for everyone irrespective of race, etc., we want justice for all". (p. 1793, V.9, Kathrada).

"We want Justice for all, we will work together with the white people, we invite them to work together with us on our programme". (p. 1794, V.9, Kathrada).

"There is no such organisation here as the Mau Mau and the Cheesa Cheesa. We have no such intention to start such organisations". (p. 1796, V.9, Resha). But compare "the struggle in Kenya has been fought in the forests, our battle will be fought in Kloff St".

Says/...

Says, "there it took the Kenya people only 18 months to make their own machine-guns"
(p. 1797, V.9, Resha).

"We want the same rights for all people
irrespective of race, colour or creed".
(p. 1797, V.9, Resha).

Non-violence urged, p. 2143, V.11

NON - VIOLENCE ETC.

VUNDELA (N.A.):

"Die mense sê dat ek instruksies gegee het dat
die Polisie moet verwijder word. Ek doen 'n
beroep op julle, julle moet niemand molesteer
nie". (This is a reference to the opposition
to W. Areas Removal Scheme). Ex.G. 1174 (1124?)
p.2.

MORETSELE:

"Christ for peace - amongst races not hatred".
Ex. G. 198 - p.2.

GILBERT NGWANE (N.A.)

"Police can get all and say Congress wants to
introduce Cheesa-Cheesa. A.N.C. non-violent.
This is a non-violent struggle". p.2143,V.11.

CHAIRMAN:

"We fight with our brains - not like the Police
with their guns....our rifle is our brains and
our mouths". p. 2145. (11).

Collection: 1956 Treason Trial
Collection number: AD1812

PUBLISHER:

Publisher:- Historical Papers, The Library, University of the Witwatersrand

Location:- Johannesburg

©2011

LEGAL NOTICES:

Copyright Notice: All materials on the Historical Papers website are protected by South African copyright law and may not be reproduced, distributed, transmitted, displayed, or otherwise published in any format, without the prior written permission of the copyright owner.

Disclaimer and Terms of Use: Provided that you maintain all copyright and other notices contained therein, you may download material (one machine readable copy and one print copy per page) for your personal and/or educational non-commercial use only.

People using these records relating to the archives of Historical Papers, The Library, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, are reminded that such records sometimes contain material which is uncorroborated, inaccurate, distorted or untrue. While these digital records are true facsimiles of paper documents and the information contained herein is obtained from sources believed to be accurate and reliable, Historical Papers, University of the Witwatersrand has not independently verified their content. Consequently, the University is not responsible for any errors or omissions and excludes any and all liability for any errors in or omissions from the information on the website or any related information on third party websites accessible from this website.