

"The Emergence of the Question of the South African Indian as an International Issue - 1860 - 1961."

I recommend the acceptance of Mr. Pachai's thesis. It certainly does fulfil the requirement set out in No. D 12 of the Regulations for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy, in that it contributes to the knowledge and understanding of the subject. It is an extremely well-documented and scholarly piece of work, written in a clear and attractive style.

Mr. Pachai has developed and rounded off his theme very ably. He has assembled an immense amount of source material and has provided a very useful historical record, not only of his main topic, but also of the various Indian bodies in South Africa and of how the association of the Indian and African Congresses originated. (He might, perhaps, have included mention of Coloured organizations, too, for example at the centre of page 713). He has very ably interwoven related events in South Africa, India and at the United Nations, and has clearly proved his point that the Indian question in South Africa can no longer be treated in isolation from the affairs of other Non-White groups. Possibly, he is a little optimistic in his end conclusions; but that is a matter of opinion.

On the whole, the thesis is balanced and objective, with the various points of view fairly expressed. Just occasionally, however, Mr. Pachai appears to have allowed his personal views to obtrude, for example page 13 (footnote 40), page 19 first paragraph (dealing with the "shortcomings" of Chinese and Malays), page 76 (first sentence of third paragraph), and the top of page 260.

I should make it clear that I am not an historian and am in no position to judge the accuracy of the early historical matter included.

If there is any intention of publishing the thesis, I would recommend certain changes first:

1. Many of the quotations from speeches or documents could with advantage be shortened. Sometimes the facts tend to be buried under too many quotations, or even to be given insufficient mention. On page 289, for example, Mr. Pachai deals at length with views on the Areas Reservation Bill, but barely mentions the terms of this Bill. Again, at the top of page 302 there is no clear explanation of the legislative measures mentioned.
2. In a few places the material might be better arranged. On page 348, for example, it is stated that Hofmeyr resigned as Minister of the Interior, but in the next few pages he is portrayed as being the Minister.
3. There are a few errors, for example:
  - a) There is an apparent omission in paragraph (c) on page 136.
  - b) Page 301, middle of second paragraph. The distinction between the Mines and Works Amendment Act and the civilized labour policy in the public service is not clearly brought out.
  - c) End of first paragraph on page 362. In wage regulating machinery wages are not determined according to race.
  - d) Page 363, last sentence of first paragraph. Indians were not segregated in trade unions in 1937. In fact, they may still belong to unions that also have White members. It was not until 1956 that mixed unions had to divide into separate racial unions or branches.
4. Mr. Pachai might, perhaps, have included more material on practical aspects of the situation - the actual effects of the Group Areas Act, the housing shortage, the inadequacy of educational facilities, etc.



These matters are, however, of comparatively minor import. On the whole I consider that Mr. Pachai has done an excellent piece of painstaking and useful work.

MURIEL HORRELL (MISS)  
RESEARCH OFFICER.

S.A. INSTITUTE OF RACE RELATIONS.

**Collection Number: AD1715**

**SOUTH AFRICAN INSTITUTE OF RACE RELATIONS (SAIRR), 1892-1974**

**PUBLISHER:**

*Collection Funder:- Atlantic Philanthropies Foundation*

*Publisher:- Historical Papers Research Archive*

*Location:- Johannesburg*

©2013

**LEGAL NOTICES:**

**Copyright Notice:** All materials on the Historical Papers website are protected by South African copyright law and may not be reproduced, distributed, transmitted, displayed, or otherwise published in any format, without the prior written permission of the copyright owner.

**Disclaimer and Terms of Use:** Provided that you maintain all copyright and other notices contained therein, you may download material (one machine readable copy and one print copy per page) for your personal and/or educational non-commercial use only.

People using these records relating to the archives of Historical Papers, The Library, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, are reminded that such records sometimes contain material which is uncorroborated, inaccurate, distorted or untrue. While these digital records are true facsimiles of paper documents and the information contained herein is obtained from sources believed to be accurate and reliable, Historical Papers, University of the Witwatersrand has not independently verified their content. Consequently, the University is not responsible for any errors or omissions and excludes any and all liability for any errors in or omissions from the information on the website or any related information on third party websites accessible from this website.

This document forms part of the archive of the South African Institute of Race Relations (SAIRR), held at the Historical Papers Research Archive at The University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, South Africa.